OFFICER REPORT

Case No: 24/02189/LBC Listed Building Consent

Proposal: Replacement of 6 x windows at the front and 3 x windows and french doors at the rear of property.

Location: 27 High Street Earith Huntingdon

Applicant: Mr W Cromie

Grid Ref: 538663 274866

DESCRIPTION OF SITE AND APPLICATION

The application site at 27 High Street is occupied by a two-storey detached dwellinghouse located within a residential area in Earith. The dwelling is a Grade II Listed Building, and the site falls within the Earith Conservation Area.

Listed Building Consent is sought for the replacement of 6x windows at the front and 3x windows and French doors at the rear of the property.

Officers have scrutinised the plans and have familiarised themselves with the site and surrounding area.

NATIONAL GUIDANCE

The National Planning Policy Framework (December 2024) (NPPF 2024) sets out the three objectives - economic, social and environmental - of the planning system to contribute to the achievement of sustainable development. The NPPF 2024 at paragraph 10 provides as follows: 'So that sustainable development is pursued in a positive way, at the heart of the Framework is a presumption in favour of sustainable development (paragraph 11).'

The NPPF 2024 sets out the Government's planning policies for (amongst other things):

* delivering a sufficient supply of homes;
* building a strong, competitive economy;
* achieving well-designed, beautiful and safe places;
* conserving and enhancing the natural, built and historic environment.

Planning Practice Guidance and the National Design Guide 2021 are also relevant and material considerations.

For full details visit the government website: https://www.gov.uk

PLANNING POLICIES

Huntingdonshire's Local Plan to 2036 (Adopted 15th May 2019)

LP34: Heritage Assets and their Settings

Huntingdonshire Landscape and Townscape Supplementary Planning Document (2022)

Earith Conservation Area Character Assessment (2008)

Local policies are viewable at https://www.huntingdonshire.gov.uk

RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

96/01306/FUL - Rebuilding of outbuilding 27 High Street Earith (Permission)

96/01307/LBC - Demolition & rebuilding of outbuilding 27 High Street Earith (Consent)

1400748LBC - Replacement of upstairs windows with double glazed. Replacement front door with similar (Consent)

24/02188/HHFUL - Replacement of 6 x windows at the front and 3 x windows and french doors at the rear of property. (Pending Consideration)

CONSULTATIONS

Earith Parish Council - Support the application, no objections.

HDC Conservation Team - Recommend refusal, make comments which are available to view in full on HDC's Public Access Site and are summarised in subsequent sections of this report.

REPRESENTATIONS

None received at the time of determination.

SUMMARY OF ISSUES

The main issues to consider in the determination of this application are:

o Impact on Heritage Assets

*Impact on Heritage Assets

The application site at 27 High Street is occupied by a detached, two storey Grade II Listed Building located within the Earith Conservation Area. The surrounding area depicts the character of a typical rural village, and there are a number of additional Listed Buildings along High Street on which the application site is located. The works which require Listed Building Consent concerns the replacement of 6 windows to the front of the dwelling, alongside 3 windows to the rear alongside the existing French doors.

The Grade II Listed Building is of 19th Century design, incorporating part of an original 17th Century timber-framed building and chimney stack. The existing windows to the front of the property at first-floor level differ from the existing ground floor windows as a result of application reference 1400748LBC, which approved the replacement of the previous windows with double glazing. However, it must be noted that the works were not in accordance with the consent, as the windows are not double glazed. The proposed replacement windows to the front of the dwelling are to consist of timber framing with 24mm thick double glazing and white plain glazing bars. When considering the proposed rear windows, these are to consist of white PVCu units with 24mm thick glazing, which is also the case for the proposed French doors.

In assessing works to a Listed Building, it should be regarded that:

Section 16(2) of the Planning (LBCA) Act 1990 (as amended) requires special regard to be had to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Section 72 of the Planning (LBCA) Act 1990 (as amended) states that special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a Conservation Area.

Section 66 of the Planning (LBCA) Act 1990 states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the Local Planning Authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Para. 212 of the NPPF sets out that 'When considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance'.
Para. 213 states that 'Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification'

Local Plan policy LP34 aligns with the statutory provisions and NPPF advice.

As this is the case, HDC's Conservation team have been consulted and having reviewed the documents have made the following comments which have been summarised below and are available in full on HDC's Public Access Site:

The submission has little justification for the removal of the existing windows, and consideration for improving the condition of the existing windows through draughtproofing and realigning casements etc. In addition, harm would be caused to the appearance of the Listed Building through the specific design and detailing of the proposed front window units as they are less suitable than the windows currently in place. Additionally, the replacement of the rear window units with PVCu material are considered inappropriate for the Listed Building due to the materials used, with a resulting bland and bulky appearance harming the historic interest of the dwelling. Whilst overall, the works would result in less than substantial harm to the Listed Building and negligible impacts on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, there are no public benefits which would outweigh this harm. Whilst there is scope to undertake appropriate works/replacement to the windows on the Listed building, the application in its current form is not acceptable, and alternative proposals should be sought.

Therefore, having regard to the comments of the HDC Conservation Officer and having assessed the proposal and undertaken a site visit, the proposal results in a less than substantial harm to the Listed Building, and negligible harm to the Conservation Area, however this harm cannot be outweighed by any public benefits. Therefore, given the above the proposal result in unacceptable harm to designated heritage assets. It therefore fails to accord with Policy LP34 of the Local Plan to 2036, the provisions of the NPPF (2024) and the Planning (LBCA) Act 1990.

*Conclusion

The windows by virtue of their design and materials would introduce visually unacceptable modern additions to the existing Listed building, which would result in harm to its historical character and appearance. Whilst the level of harm would be less than substantial, there are no public benefit which would outweigh this harm. The proposal is therefore contrary to Policy LP34 of the Local Plan and the NPPF.

Taking national and local planning policies into account, and having regard for all relevant material considerations, it is recommended that Listed Building Consent be refused.

If you would like a translation of this document, a large text version or an audio version, please contact us on 01480 388424 and we will try to accommodate your needs.

CONTACT OFFICER:
Enquiries about this report to **Josh France**